

VS/2021/0055

J
U
N
I
O
N
S

Just transition

*supporting trade unions in taking steps towards
a sustainable future
at company/sectoral level through social dialogue*

Exchange Seminar
03rd and 4th March 2022
CISL Study Center – Florence
and online

Minute

3rd March

Attendants, in presence:

Luca Mazza (Fondazione Tarantelli), Emanuele Nebbia Colomba (Fondazione Tarantelli), Alessandra Cialdoni (CGIL), Anna Maria Romano (CGIL), Cosmo Colonna (CISL), Francesco Lauria (CISL), Marcello Poli (CISL), Vilma Riolfi (CISL), Francesco Scrima (CISL), Gigi Sedran (CISL), Phanny Moray (ACV CSC), Fien Vandamme (ACV CSC), David Weinberger (Vlaams ABVV)

Attendants, online:

Emil Antonov (PODKREPA), Antonello Assogna (Fondazione Tarantelli), Sara Prodocimi (Fondazione Tarantelli), Kristian Bongelli (CFDT), Anne Juliette Lecourt (CFDT), Laure Pelletier (CFDT), Isabelle Emmerich (CFDT) Iliaria Carlino (CISL), Teresa Petrarca (CISL), Paola Vinciguerra (CISL), Katleen Parijs (ACV CSC), Joris Vaneekert (Vlaams ABVV)

9.30am – 11.20am

1. Welcome by the Cisl Study Center Director (Francesco Scrima CISL)

1.1 Roundtable of presentations

2. Updates on Project status (Iliaria Carlino, CISL)

- Iliaria briefly illustrates the steps of the project (kickoff meeting, desk research and fieldwork, meetings on how to structure the toolkit etc.)

3. Toolkit Outline presentation (Iliaria Carlino, CISL)

- The final toolkit will contain helpful and key information for unions to “navigate” the just transition
- The draft toolkit was tested in a Belgium firm, the Belgian colleagues will illustrate us the results of this first test
- The final toolkit will be forwarded to the ETUC-CES (European Trade Union Confederation), so they will be able to spread the toolkit to the partners
- The toolkit will be developed in the language of each partner (Italian, Belgian Dutch and French, Bulgarian, French)
- Toolkit features: it will be short, smart to provide key information and useful links to unionists at company and territorial level
- There will be a common part, and a specific part for each country
- There will be a part dedicated to best practices
- Each part of the toolkit will be explained during the following presentations, according to the work realized on the toolkit, in view of the test it in Belgium

4. Presentation of developed parts – by the authors of each section

4.1 Preface (Marcello Poli, CISL)

- Marcello briefly explains how the preface of the toolkit will be structured
- The target of the preface is answering a simple question: “What is the toolkit? Why is it important and useful for unionists?”
- Beyond the toolkit there will be national helpdesk with councillors, local and firm level trade unionists could ask support to national councillors and the national helpdesk to get access to helpful information
- There are three main domains, relationship of the unionist with workers, with employees and with the territory

Comments and discussion:

- Gigi CISL: It would be better to use trade unionists instead of workers representatives
- Kristian CFDT’s answer: some of them are only workers’ representatives
- All the partners agree to use “trade unionists at company/territorial level”

4.2 General information about the concept of just transition (David Weinberger, AABV)

- Just transition is a very important topic for trade unionists, but a lot of them have not idea of what to do
- To tackle Global Warming we have to adapt our economies, the EU adopted the Green Deal to create a carbon neutral economy but this will have deep implications on workers
- Introduces the donut model proposed by a British economist (Kate Raworth) to create a sustainable economy and to better visualize for workers and representatives how social issues are interlinked with ecological issues
- Workers need to be involved, Just transition will work only if unions will be involved



Comments and discussion:

- Cosmo CISL: The “donut model” is a good one, but there is a 2015 ILO document that shouldn’t be forgotten, there are five pillars and several layers, national, sectoral and firm level.
The donut model is suggestive to re-read the “just transition”, but unions need their own language, their own strategies
He suggests to start from the ILO document and enrich it with the donut economy.
- Vilma CISL’s answer: The project wants to include 2 parts: the environmental and the unionist sides of the transition. Indeed, the ILO document insists on inter-sectoral re-training and re-skilling, but if we use only the ILO’s document, we miss the environmental part of the just transition. We need to make the workers’ interests combine with the environmental interests.
- Gigi CISL: In my category (Energy) we had to face the closure of carbon plants, we had instruments that are old, they were fit for 19th century but we need a new perspective. We need a link within the EU social pillar, to make aware that we need a dialogue between territory, firms and unions.
But there are also paradoxes, for instance solar panels are more vulnerable to extreme weather conditions
- Alessandra CGIL: we, from the bank sector, have met some resistance from other more involved sectors (energy, manufacturing, etc) when talking about just transition, because these are clearly the sectors that need the widest change. We need a merging of re-industrialization and policies to preserve many jobs.
- Ilaria CISL: resuming, it might be useful to add a part on the role of the representative within the company and the territory, in order to make the toolkit more comprehensive.
- David AABV: agrees with Cosmo: we should give a reference to the ILO guidance. We have seen that this donut concept helps to make bridges with civil societies organizations and environmental organizations. We have to train our workers on the environmental issues. But we should probably also add a link to these ILO Guidelines.
- Cosmo CISL: It is important to give a signal to company level representatives that unions already have their own language, we need to make them aware that there are already studies with a union perspective on ecological transition such as the 2015 ILO guidelines.
We need to make aware that we already have some starting point, a ground floor on which to build up
- Ilaria CISL: we should be very concrete in organising the debate according to what we have to put in the toolkit. Do we want to include these thoughts in the section of the general information of the concept of just transition or do we need to add another section?
- Vilma CISL: I think we should add the ILO guidelines in the section of general info on just transition. We should make the workers aware that with plants closures a bigger regional mobility will be needed. The unionists should make the workers aware that we are in front of a paradigm change, that a job loss could happen and that reskilling will be a must, that it may be necessary to move often to one place to another and for example an house-rent system could be needed
- Joris AABV: We don’t need a detailed just transition recap, just an “appetizer” to make them aware and to provide them key information

11.40am - 1pm



4.3 Outline of EU situation (Fien Vandamme, ACV-CSC)

- Visual representation with deadlines and goals, half a page or a bit longer is enough. Paris agreement (key points), EU Green Deal (main goals).

4.4 Current situation in the country (Phanny Moray, ACV-CSC)

- Explains briefly the complexity of the Belgian political and institutional system (federal/regional) to give an example of how the presentation of each country can be done.
- National plans set to targets set by the EU.

4.5 Financial resources at EU (Paola Vinciguerra, CISL)

- The EU target is the carbon neutrality by 2050
- The banking system should support the ecological transition
- A fundamental turning point has been 2018 with the European Commission action plan on sustainable finance (for a more detailed picture see Paola's slides)
- It is composed by 10 key actions, a key macro-category is to re-orient financial flows towards sustainable economy (creating a green EU label)
- Another key point is the credit system. What should banks do to sustain green economy?
- The just transition fund will mobilize 25 billions of investments with other 25 billions from the just transition scheme
- Beyond that it will be necessary to develop an European bargaining processes to bind firms
- There is also a financial reporting directive to push big companies to adopt and to report their sustainability plans
- Some certifying credit bodies should help banks to monitoring companies and investments
- It should be important also to have a social taxonomy

Comments and discussion:

- Francesco CISL: just to add a point. There is more and more stress on non-financial reporting, connected to sustainability. How to link it with the objectives of the project? The challenge is to have access to those reporting and to be able for unions to utilize those elements in the bargaining processes.
It is important that unions are able to assess them through information rights
- Cosmo CISL: It is important to have access, to study the "sustainability plans of firms" and to start from them in a firm level bargaining. Unions can also ask by law to be involved in the creation of parts of those sustainability plans
- David AABV: Agrees with Cosmo. It is important to integrate this part in the bargaining, that representatives use those information to do their jobs.
Suggests to put something in the toolkit on how to use the "non-financial reporting" and the taxonomy suggested by Paola
- Gigi CISL: This non-financial reporting is not only binding for large firms but it is also asked for smaller firms when they receive ESG funds.

It is a way for the Union to become a controller, somehow a new way to behave of the unions that can open up new bargaining spaces

- Ilaria CISL: to resume, we can use Paola's presentation regarding the funds for just transition and the concerned scheme, in the section we have already decided of the common parts. But we can also add some boxes to include CSR and taxonomy. Regarding the social aspects of the transition, they are already included in the tools David will present.
- Fien ACV-CSC and David AABV: agree with Ilaria

4.6 Financial resources at national level (Joris Vaneeckert, AABV):

- He showed how they elaborated their national toolkit, providing useful links and information (see presentation)

Comments and discussion:

- David AABV: just to add that it is important to have this section because with that, trade unionists can suggest granting/funding opportunities to their employers to make investments.

2.30-4 pm

4.7 Information and consultation rights as a tool for trade union representatives, by Country/region (Fien Vandamme and Phanny Moray, ACV-CSC)

- It was asked to them if those information were accessible also to NGOs
- Those rights in Belgium are specific for trade unionists (not for NGOs) and they have been inserted and are all visible on the links in the national toolkit

Comments and discussion:

- Ilaria CISL: do you think we can use the same structure for all the countries?
- Gigi's answer: Not all the trade union members are aware of those rights, so it would be helpful
- Paola CISL: besides the national examples, do you expect to disseminate the toolkit to other countries too?
- Ilaria CISL's answer: yes, one of the project steps is to transmit the English version of the toolkit to ETUC, and then the national parts will be in each language of the partners
- Vilma CISL's answer: the idea is to have a toolkit to be applied all around Europe, so to include the common part with European info (this part has to be sent to ETUC for dissemination among all partners) and the national parts (in each language). In the version to be sent to ETUC we could include the titles of the national parts in view of giving everyone the idea of the national parts too.
- Francesco CISL's answer: ETUC is partner of the project, so we could ask their feedback once we have a proposal to give to them
- Laure CFDT: we have a new law in France called "Loi Climat et Résilience (?)", that provides those type of rights, this could be inserted in the section we are talking about

4.8 Vocational training, Training opportunities (Katleen Parijs and Fien Vandamme, ACV CSC)

- Fien ACV-CSC: an example of grid to list the possibilities at different levels: European or national/regional level, and sectoral (trade unions and civil society) levels. Short description and links to resources.

4.9 Cases, good practices, stories (CISL)

- Ilaria CISL: We agreed also on including a summary of national good practices, and links to external resources. We should include two good practices for each country. We have prepared a table that summarises all the good practices you sent to us.

Comments and discussion:

- Emil PODKREPA: we selected 6 good practices from different sectors. We need time to select 2 of them, and to know the criteria of selection
- Vilma CISL: A criteria to select the good practices must be the **transferability** to other countries
- Ilaria CISL: another criteria could be the **involvement of trade unions** in the practice
- Emanuele CISL: Briefly explains two good practices in Italy, from two multiutilities participated enterprises Hera (based mainly in Emilia Romagna) and A2A (based mainly in Lombardia) regarding the involvement of the territory in the decision making processes and to link salary bonuses (premio di produzione to sustainability targets)
- Sara CISL: we have focused on these 2 practices because of the active role that the trade unions can have in receiving the needs of the company or territory, and consequently propose some concrete actions
- Gigi CISL: In Italy there is an instrument to mention called "Conferenza dei Servizi". There is a particular case of "bonifiche" (reclamation of former industrial areas) that is of Ministerial Competences, were Unions are involved, but it is a very specific case, normally unions are not very involved in the dialogue between firms and territories.
- Antonello CISL: Some best practices are the refineries that have been re-converted from oil to biogas, and there is the petrochemical pole of Porto Torres that has shifted his production from polymers to bio plastics.
There are also some salt pans "saline" that became a touristic poles, one of them has 17.000 tourists per year. It happens because at the head of the production network there is ENI (a state owned multinational enterprise) that has the power and can invest on sustainability even if its core business it still oil.
- Paola CISL: going back to the criteria, I think the involvement of trade unions and other stakeholders are very important, as well as transferability. For this last point, if we are able to have for instance 1 good practice for each sector, we could have a very interesting wide picture.
- Fien ACV-CSC: isn't it better to proceed by listing the practices according to themes (solar panels, training programs, ... inter-sectoral themes) instead of sectors. Let's be also aware of the risk of green washing for some that seem to be good practices.

- Teresa CISL: I agree with Fien, we should think at it **through inter-sectoral concepts**: reuse, waste reductions, reuse of materials in the production cycle. I represent the metallurgic sector, we are training our representatives on how to insert those topics on the collective bargaining
- Alessandra CGIL: also the measurability of those efforts is important, and it is missing. In our sector (banking) often big company use green washing strategies
- Ilaria CISL: to resume, the criteria can be: involvement of TU, transferability, actual practices that we can measure, significance for the company/territory, include inter-sectoral elements.
- Gigi CISL: remembers the main weapon for Trade Unions is still collective bargaining, we should not forget it.
To enforce rights and duties towards labour but also rights and duties towards the environment (also recently included in the Italian Constitution)
- Vilma CISL's answer: this last part is very important and should be included in the Italian part
- Emanuele CISL: it is important at least for the Italian case to include the "Enti Bilaterali" and the training and re-training systems of the workforce
- Ilaria CISL's answer: this has to be included in the Italian part related to training opportunities

5. Analysis tools (Vilma Rinolfi, CISL)

- She explains the structure of the toolkit, 3 dimensions: relation/bargaining with entrepreneurs, relation with the workers he/she represents, relation with the territory

5.1 Relation/bargaining with entrepreneurs (David Weinberger, AABV)

- A tool to make a 360° analysis of the company with regards to just transition (see presentation).
- The donut tool, with a questionnaire with 7 subjects, and 5 questions per subject.
- The economic traffic light
- Self-assessment, in-depth analysis, with that we can also stimulates proposals of bargaining with the company

4.25-5.30 pm

5.2 Relations with the workers (Vilma Rinolfi and Marcello Poli, CISL)

- A self-assessment tool for trade unionists to assess the situation of just transition in relation with the workers they represent, and then propose actions. It must include:
- A grid with characteristics of the workers (see presentation)
- Food for thought (see presentation)



- A mathematical tool (the donut again) to be used by the TU in case they need a tool that helps them to better define the position of the workers on the different subjects

5.3 Relations with the territory (Vilma Rinolfi, CISL)

- A section on the territory has been developed. Role of local institutions, role of public transports, evaluate the needs of the area (for instance it could happen that in an industrial declining area tourism is developing fast for example and this could be connected with the local training systems)

Comments and discussion:

- Gigi CISL:
 - We should make aware workers that climate change really affects their daily life
 - Maybe we should add to the questionnaire "How many days of work did you loss for snow, environment events? Or to private proprieties? For example automobiles" To make them aware of the concrete effects
 - And to unionist we should ask do you have instruments to protect? Do you have systems to go at work earlier? For example in construction sites we had some deaths in the last years in Italy related to high temperatures
 - If we extend to emergency workers (they could add some good points... for example blackouts are often given from meteorological events)
- Vilma and Teresa CISL: The "edili" (construction workers) already have contracts that allows them to not work beyond 35° degrees. But this should be added on the risk assessment. The electricity contracts are covered by CIG in case of bad weather.
- Ilaria CISL: We should always bear in mind that those inputs should always be directed to union action, collective action in a circular process of feedback with the base, it is a very simple scheme that includes possible steps for negotiating the JT at company level. Every partner is asked to assess whether include it in the toolkit (and in that case to contribute to its formulation) or not.

End of the day



4th March

Attendants, in presence:

Luca Mazza (Fondazione Tarantelli), Emanuele Nebbia Colomba (Fondazione Tarantelli), Alessandra Cialdoni (CGIL), Anna Maria Romano (CGIL), Cosmo Colonna (CISL), Francesco Lauria (CISL), Marcello Poli (CISL), Vilma Rinolfi (CISL), Gigi Sedran (CISL), Phanny Moray (ACV CSC), Fien Vandamme (ACV CSC), David Weinberger (Vlaams ABVV)

Attendants, online:

Emil Antonov (PODKREPA), Iliaria Carlino (CISL), Antonello Gisotti (CISL), Isabelle Emmerich (CFDT), Laure Pelletier (CFDT), Paola Vinciguerra (CISL), Joris Vaneekert (Vlaams ABVV)

9.30 – 10.45 am

- Iliaria CISL opens the session by resuming the key points of the first day
- Paola CISL adds some elements for the part of the toolkit intended to suggest actions/proposals to the TU, after the analysis.
She explains the PDCA cycle. It's a simple model (Plan-do-check-act) subdivided into 10 steps that could be added to the toolkit (see slides)
- Iliaria CISL: yesterday we finished with the explanation of the tools for the analysis of company sustainability (questionnaire etc.) the question now is to insert also this PDCA plan on the toolkit

Comments and discussion:

- David AABV: it is a good idea to use the PDCA, we just have to make sure that everything is clear for the trade unionists themselves.
- Everyone agrees, the PDCA plan it seems already quite developed and everything that can help the delegates to, it is agreed that after the meeting there will be an e-mail exchange on this PDCA plan proposed by Paola Vinciguerra. CISL will send a proposal of introduction of the PDCA in the toolkit, to be assessed whether at the beginning of the analysis tool or elsewhere.

6. Results of Tests in Belgium (David Weinberger ABVV, and Phanny Moray ACV-CSC)

David ABVV explains the output of the first toolkit tests conducted in Belgium

- It was tested in three occasions with TU delegates:
 1. Company donut in a group of 6 reps from various sectors (banking, food, organic waste processing, steel,...)
 2. Company donut + economic traffic light from 1 rep in a chemical plant
 3. self-assessment checklist on economic issues in a group of 10 reps from various sectors (chemistry petroleum, care, social workplace, food)
- The first test was done without the questionnaire but conducting a group discussion on the "donut"
- The TU pointed out that it is difficult to understand if a firm is really involved in sustainability plan or if it is only greenwashing



- They said there is no question on night work, shift works that could be added
- A unionist said that it would be interesting to see how they perform compared to other companies
- Still have one test left to do in a company

Comments and discussion:

- Vilma CISL: did the rep ask to add something in the toolkit?
- David's answer: not much beside the night shifts
- Gigi CISL: Probably a **glossary** within the toolkit is needed, "what is just transition? What is environment sociologically intended?" Maybe it is not clear for workers and trade union representatives

Phanny ACV-CSC shares the test that she conducted

- The test was conducted in 2 companies, 1 from steel industry and 1 from food production
- It took three hours and many questions were unanswered
- There is a question not clear. "The company has green house plans? Are them in line with the EU targets?" For one part of the question is yes, for the other is no.
- Sometimes the respondents have no information on the questions, because it may be not their competence. We should therefore include representatives from all the consultation bodies to avoid that.
- It was difficult for the respondents to transfer the answer in the donut, so I had to make it by myself. The excel developed by David could be a good solution.
- There is a big lack of information from the workers, they might have no interests on the matter, or even not being aware that they have the right to get access to these information. So we should maybe insert a list of questions the workers or trade unionists can ask to the managers regarding the just transition, theme by theme, for bargaining. And this can be inserted in the ICP rights section. ACV-CSC can handle it because I have a very experienced colleague who can support us.

Comments and discussion:

- David ABVV: We interviewed quite experienced unionists, used to social dialogue, for example, if they see a question and don't know the answer... they will bring it to the table of social dialogue
- Phanny ACV-CSC: There is a lack of information and consultation right from the trade unionists side Reps didn't know. The health and safety representatives must be included so that we can have back the biggest amount of information
- Vilma CISL: We should reflect on that. Should we include all trade unionists of the same firm? Also health and safety representatives?
- Alessandra CGIL: In the Italian system there is a distinction between the two figures RSA and RSL, there are shop stewards, and safety representatives that have some rights to have access to specific information. We need a collaboration. Not always there is a good flow of information between the two, often they are busy so in Italy it would be useful to share the toolkit to both of them.
- Vilma CISL: We have always to bear in mind that the toolkit must be an instrument to reflect on the priorities on which the TU should negotiate.

Concluding remarks:



- Ilaria CISL: It was agreed by the partners that at the beginning of the questionnaire there will be an incipit that recommends to different union representatives to work together. She defines the next steps and tasks:
 - David, Phanny and Fien will work on the questionnaire
 - CISL will look at the introductive part of the analysis tools
 - Gigi CISL will work on the glossary
 - Paola CISL will share the PDCA slides with all the partners
- Antonello CISL: I can share with Gigi and CISL the glossary that, as FIM CISL, we are providing to our delegates during an ongoing cycle of meetings around Italy titled "Construction sites for Green Bargaining".

11.05-12.45 am

7. The training course of the Just Transition project (Francesco Lauria, CISL)

- The final toolkit will be sent to the CES
- We need to share/spread the toolkit also for the training of counsellors
- First point is the training of the counsellors, we will start with the first pilot course that will last 2-5 days and will be targeted to the counsellors and to the interested unionists at the sectoral, territorial and company level.
- There also will be a meeting among counsellors from each country to create a transnational network
- The toolkit is of a milestones of the project and will be part of the training materials. We should remember to forward the toolkit (the common parts) to the ETUI and ETUC, that have already many ongoing projects "on green skills", for diffusion to other EU countries.
- The date for the Italian national training could be from 12th to 14th September; those of the transnational at least 1 month later. Is it ok for you?

Comments and discussion:

- Isabelle CFDT: Before October is impossible because they have the Congress, there will be a lot of changes in their staff
- Paola CISL: She agrees that one month gap from the pilot training to the other meeting is not enough
- Francesco CISL: we have to work now on the skills profile of the counsellors.
- There are two key elements entry level competences: transversal competences and specific competences. Let's define them together, starting from the transversal ones:

Group discussion that raises the following transversal competences:

- English is an added value but it is difficult to find competent and English speaking candidates
- They need to be highly motivated
- They need to have time because trade unionists are often busy
- Coming from different sectors
- Engagement. They need to be backed and supported by their organization. In other words a mandate from the Confederation, an awareness of the importance of the counsellors



- Being facilitators of processes
- Transversal / Inter-sectoral. Three counsellors for each country possibly at the confederal level are required, but they need to know well the structure of the confederations and federations. The choice can be to have three confederal level counsellors or to have a counsellor for each of the most interested macro-sectors. We have also to consider the division into regions.
 - o French partners prefer sectoral counsellors
 - o In the project document the counsellors are expected to be at confederal level
 - o Belgian counsellors are at Regional and Confederal level, we are there to help the sectors if they ask, we are not there to tell them what to do.

Given that, probably in the national courses it will be important to focus on "how to be a counsellor", in the sense of how to structure the relation with the sectoral federations. What do you think?

- o Alessandra CGIL's answer: the macro-sectoral can really be our target
- o Antonello CISL's answer: highlight on the transnationality. He would prefer to have a counsellor in each category because each sector has its own specificity.
- o Gigi CISL: it is important that counsellors create an inter-sectoral network during and after the training
- David ABVV: It is important to have a strict link to shop stewards, being able to work with company level trade unionists, being able to translate theoretical concepts to workers.

Group discussion that raises the following specific competences:

- Gigi CISL: To have clear the objectives of the just transition
- Antonello CISL: I found it useful to check the competences that firms are giving to their HSE managers. Competences asked are on the mobility management, negotiation of training with specific focus on just transition
- Vilma CISL: knowledge of ICP rights
- Ilaria CISL: familiarity with EU databases
- Antonello CISL: Knowledge of environmental certifications
- Francesco CISL, recap:
 - o we will verify the dates of the training
 - o we will enrich the file of the skills profile
 - o we will ask the partners a trainer representative that will be responsible/contact person for the training
 - o we will clarify the issue of the political mandate for counsellors from the confederation
- Belgian representatives attending the seminar in presence have clarified, after Vilma CISL's direct question, that they work 100% of their time on environmental matters.
- Ilaria CISL: Final Recap of the agreed themes and next steps.

End of the day

